

12.3

Module Overview

Researching Multiple Perspectives to Develop a Position

Texts	12.3.1: <i>Guns, Germs, and Steel</i>, Jared Diamond Students also choose from the following model research sources: • Source #1: “Empowering Women is Smart Economics” by Ana Revenga and Sudhir Shetty • Source #2: “Poverty Facts and Stats” by Anup Shah • Source #3: “Evidence For Action: Gender Equality and Economic Growth” by John Ward, Bernice Lee, Simon Baptist, and Helen Jackson • Source #4: “How Many Americans Live in Poverty?” by Pam Fessler • Source #5: “Human Capital Investment in the Developing World: An Analysis of Praxis” by Adeyemi O. Ogunade • Source #6: “The Case for Universal Basic Education for the World’s Poorest Boys and Girls” by Gene B. Sperling • Source #7: “2005 EFA Global Monitoring Report. Education for All: The Quality Imperative” by UNESCO • Source #8: “Bridging the Gender Divide: How Technology Can Advance Women Economically” by Kirrin Gill, Kim Brooks, James McDougall, Payal Patel, and Aslihan Kes • Source #9: “Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals” by Jeffrey D. Sachs, et al. • Source #10: “Economic Impacts of Broadband” by Christine Zhen-Wei Qiang and Carlo M. Rossotto with Kaoru Kimura in <i>Information and Communications for Development 2009: Extending Reach and Increasing Impact</i> by World Bank Publications 12.3.2: Student research sources vary. By 12.3.2, students have chosen texts for research based on their individual problem-based questions.
Number of Lessons in Module	41 (including Module 12.3 Performance Assessment)

Introduction

In Module 12.3, students engage in an inquiry-based, iterative research process that serves as the basis of a culminating research-based argument paper. Building on work with evidence-based analysis in Modules 12.1 and 12.2, students use a seed text to surface and explore issues that lend themselves to multiple positions and perspectives. Module 12.3 fosters students' independent learning by decreasing scaffolds in key research lessons as students gather and analyze research based on vetted sources to establish a position of their own. Students first generate a written evidence-based perspective, which serves as the early foundation of what will ultimately become their research-based argument paper.

In 12.3.1, students read closely excerpts of *Guns, Germs, and Steel* by Jared Diamond, which explores the ultimate causes for resource and wealth inequity across the globe. While analyzing the text, students consider Diamond's purpose and how he structures ideas in his complex research to support his various claims. Additionally, in preparation for their own argument writing students evaluate Diamond's claims, evidence, and reasoning about the causes and explanations of inequality of resources across societies throughout history to the modern-day. The text serves as a springboard to research, as students surface and track potential research issues that emerge from the text.

In the second half of 12.3.1, students' focus turns more heavily toward the research process. Students engage in this iterative process by pursuing self-selected areas of investigation as they gather, assess, read, and analyze sources. Students also begin to organize and synthesize research findings to establish a perspective about a specific problem-based question.

In 12.3.2, students engage in the writing process with the goal of articulating and supporting their evidence-based research perspective. The end product of 12.3.2 is a final draft of a research-based argument paper that synthesizes and supports several claims using relevant and sufficient evidence and valid reasoning. The writing cycle, in which students self-edit, peer review, and continually revise their work, serves as the primary framework for 12.3.2.

Literacy Skills & Habits

- Read closely for textual details.
- Annotate texts to support comprehension and analysis.
- Engage in productive, evidence-based conversations about texts.
- Conduct independent searches and assess sources for credibility, relevance, and accessibility.
- Develop, refine, and select inquiry questions for independent research.
- Collect and organize evidence from research to support analysis in writing.
- Identify and evaluate arguments and claims in texts.
- Generate an evidence-based perspective from research.
- Revise writing.

- Utilize rubrics for self-assessment and peer review of writing.
- Craft a research-based argument paper.

English Language Arts Outcomes

Yearlong Target Standards

These standards embody the pedagogical shifts required by the Common Core State Standards and are a strong focus in every English Language Arts module and unit in grades 9–12.

CCS Standards: Reading—Literature	
RL.11-12.1	Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain.
RL.11-12.4	Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone, including words with multiple meanings or language that is particularly fresh, engaging, or beautiful. (Include Shakespeare as well as other authors.)
RL.11-12.10	By the end of grade 12, read and comprehend literature, including stories, dramas, and poems, at the high end of the grades 11–CCR text complexity band and proficiently.
CCS Standards: Reading—Informational Text	
RI.11-12.1.a	Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain. a. Develop factual, interpretive, and evaluative questions for further exploration of the topic(s).
RI.11-12.4	Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including figurative, connotative, and technical meanings; analyze how an author uses and refines the meaning of a key term or terms over the course of a text (e.g., how Madison defines <i>faction</i> in <i>Federalist</i> No. 10).
RI.11-12.10	By the end of grade 12, read and comprehend literary nonfiction at the high end of the grades 11–CCR text complexity band independently and proficiently.

CCS Standards: Writing	
W.11-12.9.a,b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. - Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literature (e.g., “Demonstrate knowledge of eighteenth-, nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century foundational works of American literature, including how two or more texts from the same period treat similar themes or topics”). - Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]”).
W.11-12.10	Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audiences.
CCS Standards: Speaking & Listening	
SL.11-12.1	Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues</i> , building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.
CCS Standards: Language	
L.11-12.4.a-d	Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11–12 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies. - Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word’s position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase. - Identify and correctly use patterns of word changes that indicate different meanings or parts of speech (e.g., <i>conceive, conception, conceivable</i>). - Consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning, its part of speech, its etymology, or its standard usage. - Verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase (e.g., by checking the inferred meaning in context or in a dictionary).

Module-Specific Standards

Assessed Standards

These standards are the specific focus of instruction and assessment, based on the texts studied and proficiencies developed in Module 12.3.

College and Career Readiness Anchor Standards for Reading	
CCRA.8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.
CCS Standards: Reading – Literature	
None.	
CCS Standards: Reading – Informational Text	
RI.11-12.1.a	Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain. a. Develop factual, interpretive, and evaluative questions for further exploration of the topic(s).
RI.11-12.3	Analyze a complex set of ideas or sequence of events and explain how specific individuals, ideas, or events interact and develop over the course of the text.
RI.11-12.6	Determine an author's point of view or purpose in a text in which the rhetoric is particularly effective, analyzing how style and content contribute to the power, persuasiveness, or beauty of the text.
CCS Standards: Writing	
W.11-12.1.a-e	Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. Explore and inquire into areas of interest to formulate an argument. a. Introduce precise, knowledgeable claim(s), establish the significance of the claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that logically sequences claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence. b. Develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, supplying the most relevant evidence for each while pointing out the strengths and limitations of both in a manner that anticipates the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases. c. Use words, phrases, and clauses as well as varied syntax to link the major sections of

	the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships between claim(s) and reasons, between reasons and evidence, and between claim(s) and counterclaims. d. Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing. e. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the argument presented.
W.11-12.2.a-f	Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content. a. Introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; include formatting (e.g., headings), graphics (e.g., figures, tables), and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension. b. Develop the topic thoroughly by selecting the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. c. Use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. d. Use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. e. Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing. f. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the information or explanation presented (e.g., articulating implications or the significance of the topic).
W.11-12.4	Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.
W.11-12.5	Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach, focusing on addressing what is most significant for a specific purpose and audience.
W.11-12.7	Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject, demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.
W.11-12.8	Gather relevant information from multiple authoritative print and digital sources, using advanced searches effectively; assess the strengths and limitations of each source in

	terms of the task, purpose, and audience; integrate information into the text selectively to maintain the flow of ideas, avoiding plagiarism and overreliance on any one source and following a standard format for citation.
W.11-12.9	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.
CCS Standards: Speaking & Listening	
SL.11-12.1.d	Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues</i> , building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives; synthesize comments, claims, and evidence made on all sides of an issue; resolve contradictions when possible; and determine what additional information or research is required to deepen the investigation or complete the task.
SL.11-12.4	Present information, findings, and supporting evidence, conveying a clear and distinct perspective, such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning, alternative or opposing perspectives are addressed, and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and a range of formal and informal tasks.
SL.11-12.5	Make strategic use of digital media (e.g., textual, graphical, audio, visual, and interactive elements) in presentations to enhance understanding of findings, reasoning, and evidence and to add interest.
SL.11-12.6	Adapt speech to a variety of contexts and tasks, demonstrating a command of formal English when indicated or appropriate.
CCS Standards: Language	
L.11-12.1	Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.
L.11-12.2	Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.
L.11-12.3	Apply knowledge of language to understand how language functions in different contexts, to make effective choices for meaning or style, and to comprehend more fully when reading or listening.

Addressed Standards

These standards will be addressed at the unit or module level, and may be considered in assessment, but will not be the focus of extended instruction in Module 12.3.

CCS Standards: Reading – Literature	
None.	
CCS Standards: Reading – Informational Text	
None.	
CCS Standards: Writing	
W.11-12.9.b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]").
CCS Standards: Speaking & Listening	
SL.11-12.1.a,c	Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives.
SL.11-12.3	Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, assessing the stance, premises, links among ideas, word choice, points of emphasis, and tone used.
CCS Standards: Language	
L.11-12.1.b	Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking. b. Resolve issues of complex or contested usage, consulting references (e.g., <i>Merriam-Webster's Dictionary of English Usage</i>, <i>Garner's Modern American Usage</i>) as needed.

L.11-12.2.a,b	Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing. a. Observe hyphenation conventions. b. Spell correctly.
L.11-12.3.a	Apply knowledge of language to understand how language functions in different contexts, to make effective choices for meaning or style, and to comprehend more fully when reading or listening. a. Vary syntax for effect, consulting references (e.g., Tufte's <i>Artful Sentences</i>) for guidance as needed; apply an understanding of syntax to the study of complex texts when reading.
L.11-12.4.a,c	Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11–12 reading and content</i> , choosing flexibly from a range of strategies. a. Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word's position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase. c. Consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning, its part of speech, its etymology, or its standard usage.
L.11-12.6	Acquire and use accurately general academic and domain-specific words and phrases, sufficient for reading, writing, speaking, and listening at the college and career readiness level; demonstrate independence in gathering vocabulary knowledge when considering a word or phrase important to comprehension or expression.

Module 12.3 Performance Assessment

Prompt

In this three-lesson Performance Assessment, students complete their multimedia research journals by crafting a single 5–10 minute multimedia narrative that includes elements of their individual research processes and findings. After responding to a final retrospective prompt in the previous lesson's homework, students spend the first two lessons editing and synthesizing the multimedia journal entries they created over the course of Module 12.3 into a succinct, cohesive narrative, adding effects, narration, and other stylistic elements as needed to enhance the final product. In the third and final lesson of this Performance Assessment, students present their multimedia narratives to an audience and respond to questions.

Prompt:

Over the course of Module 12.3, you have analyzed an issue in response to your problem-based question. You have developed your understanding of the issue through research and arrived at your own perspective. You have presented your central claim, supporting claims, counterclaims, reasoning, and evidence in a formal research-based argument paper. You have also documented this process by responding periodically to multimedia journal prompts.

To answer the prompt, begin by reflecting on the work you have done over the course of Module 12.3 and the progression of your research process as reflected in your multimedia journal entries. Build on your research and analysis by crafting a single 5–10 minute multimedia narrative that conveys how your research process led you to your findings. Using relevant excerpts from the multimedia journal entries you completed over the course of this module, your final product should depict cohesively the evolution of your research. Your final product should present a cohesive story of the research process that led you to your final central claim, and should therefore include your final central claim, several supporting claims, reasoning, and evidence. The final product should draw clear connections between early research and the final claims, as this project documents that development. Edit, delete, paste together, and add voiceover, interviews, and effects where appropriate in order to achieve this goal.

Finally, present your multimedia narratives to an audience, with whom you will engage in a question and answer session following your presentation. The audience comprises peers, community members, teachers, alumni, and/or other students.

Lesson 1

In lesson 1, students form pairs and respond briefly to the previous lesson's homework question: How are your multimedia journal entries different from or similar to Alex Blumberg's podcasts? Students then begin the process of editing all of their multimedia journal entries into final 5–10 minute narratives. Students account for and reflect on their entire research process as they select highlights for their final narratives, making sure to include details about how they arrived at their final central claims, supporting claims, evidence, and reasoning.

Lesson 2

In lesson 2, students finish editing their 5–10 minute multimedia narrative presentations, making strategic use of multimedia to convey a firsthand experience of the research process and findings. Students use voiceover techniques, volume manipulation, and various other multimedia techniques in order to create a polished and cohesive final product.

Lesson 3

In lesson 3, students present their final multimedia narratives to an audience by playing their audio or

video presentation. Students also engage in a brief question and answer session following each presentation. Students respond thoughtfully to audience questions and comments, clarifying, verifying, or challenging ideas if necessary.

Texts

12.3.1: Using a Seed Text as a Springboard to Engage in Inquiry-Based Research

- Diamond, Jared. *Guns, Germs, and Steel: The Fates of Human Societies*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1999.
- Students also choose from the following model research sources:
 - Source #1: “Empowering Women is Smart Economics” by Ana Revenga and Sudhir Shetty
 - Source #2: “Poverty Facts and Stats” by Anup Shah
 - Source #3: “Evidence For Action: Gender Equality and Economic Growth” by John Ward, Bernice Lee, Simon Baptist, and Helen Jackson
 - Source #4: “How Many Americans Live in Poverty?” by Pam Fessler
 - Source #5: “Human Capital Investment in the Developing World: An Analysis of Praxis” by Adeyemi O. Ogunade
 - Source #6: “The Case for Universal Basic Education for the World’s Poorest Boys and Girls” by Gene B. Sperling
 - Source #7: “2005 EFA Global Monitoring Report. Education For All: The Quality Imperative” by UNESCO
 - Source #8: “Bridging the Gender Divide: How Technology Can Advance Women Economically” by Kirrin Gill, Kim Brooks, James McDougall, Payal Patel, and Aslihan Kes
 - Source #9: “Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals” by Jeffrey D. Sachs, et al.
 - Source #10: “Economic Impacts of Broadband” by Christine Zhen-Wei Qiang and Carlo M. Rossotto with Kaoru Kimura in *Information and Communications for Development 2009: Extending Reach and Increasing Impact* by World Bank Publications

12.3.2: Synthesizing Research and Argument Through the Writing Process

Student research sources vary. By 12.3.2, students have chosen texts for research based on their individual problem-based questions.

Module-at-a-Glance Calendar

Text	Lessons in the Unit	Literacy Skills and Habits	Assessed and Addressed CCSS	Assessments
12.3.1: Using a Seed Text as a Springboard to Engage in Inquiry-Based Research				
<i>Guns, Germs, and Steel</i> (Jared Diamond) Students also choose from the following model research sources: 1. “Empowering Women is Smart Economics” by Ana Revenga and Sudhir Shetty 2. “Poverty Facts and Stats” by Anup Shah 3. “Evidence For Action: Gender Equality and Economic Growth” by John Ward, Bernice Lee, Simon Baptist, and Helen Jackson 4. “How Many Americans Live in Poverty?” by Pam Fessler 5. “Human Capital	27	• Read closely for textual details. • Annotate texts to support comprehension and analysis. • Engage in productive, evidence-based discussions about texts. • Collect and organize evidence from texts to support analysis in writing. • Collect and organize evidence from texts to support claims made in writing. • Use vocabulary strategies to define unknown words. • Identify potential issues for research within texts. • Conduct pre-searches to validate sufficiency of information for exploring potential issues. • Delineate	CCRA.R.8 RI.11-12.1.a RI.11-12.3 RI.11-12.6 W.11-12.1.a,b W.11-12.2.a-f W.11-12.4 W.11-12.7 W.11-12.8 W.11-12.9.b SL.11-12.1.a,c,d SL.11-12.3 SL.11-12.4 L.11-12.1 L.11-12.2 L.11-12.4.a,c	Mid-Unit: Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text: Choose an excerpt from <i>Guns, Germs, and Steel</i>. Identify one of Diamond’s supporting claims; evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient and the reasoning is valid to support that claim. End-of-Unit: Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from their sources: Write a two-page synthesis of your conclusions and perspective derived from your research. Draw on your research evidence to express your perspective on your problem-based question.

Investment in the Developing World: An Analysis of Praxis” by Adeyemi O. Ogunade 6. “The Case for Universal Basic Education for the World’s Poorest Boys and Girls” by Gene B. Sperling 7. “Education for All Global Monitoring Report, 2005” by UNESCO 8. “Bridging the Gender Divide: How Technology Can Advance Women Economically” by Kirrin Gill, Kim Brooks, James McDougall, Payal Patel, and Aslihan Kes 9. “Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals” by Jeffrey D.		arguments and explain relevant and sufficient evidence and valid reasoning. - Analyze perspectives in potential research texts. - Assess sources for credibility, relevance, and accessibility. - Conduct independent searches using research processes including planning for searches, assessing sources, annotating sources, recording notes, and evaluating arguments. - Develop, refine, and select inquiry questions to guide research. - Develop and continually assess a research frame to guide independent searches. - Craft claims about inquiry questions, inquiry paths, and a problem-based question using specific textual		
---	--	---	--	--

Sachs, et al. 10. “Economic Impacts of Broadband” by Christine Zhen-Wei Qiang and Carlo M. Rossotto with Kaoru Kimura in <i>Information and Communications for Development 2009: Extending Reach and Increasing Impact</i> by World Bank Publications		evidence from the research. • Develop counterclaims in opposition to claims. • Create oral presentations, keeping in mind the audience’s concerns, values, and potential biases.		
---	--	--	--	--

12.3.2: Synthesizing Research and Argument Through the Writing Process				
Student research sources vary. By 12.3.2, students have chosen texts for research based on their individual problem-based questions.	11	• Create an outline to organize evidence collected. • Analyze, synthesize, and organize evidence-based claims. • Write effective introduction, body, and conclusion paragraphs for a research-based argument paper. • Use proper MLA citation methods in writing. • Edit for a variety of language conventions, including hyphens and correct punctuation, capitalization, and spelling. • Use formal style and objective tone in writing. • Demonstrate clarity and cohesion in writing. • Vary syntax for effect, consulting references when needed.	W.11-12.1.a-e W.11-12.4 W.11-12.5 W.11-12.7 W.11-12.8 W.11-12.9 SL.11-12.1 SL.11-12.4 SL.11-12.5 SL.11-12.6 L.11-12.1.b L.11-12.2.a,b L.11-12.3.a L.11-12.6	End-of-Unit: Students are assessed on their final drafts of their research-based argument papers. The final draft should present a precise claim supported by relevant and sufficient evidence and valid reasoning. The draft should be well organized, distinguish claims from alternate and opposing claims, and use transitional language that clearly links the major sections of the text and clarifies relationships among the claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning. Finally, the draft should demonstrate control of the conventions of written language and maintain a formal style and objective tone.

Note: Bold text indicates targeted standards that will be assessed in the module.